

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
AUGUST 25, 2014**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman
Alderman Craig Schmid
David Richardson
Anthony Robinson
Erin Wright

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Chairman Richard Callow called the roll. Five(5) Board members were in attendance. Board member David Richardson moved to approve the current Agenda. Alderman Schmid seconded the motion and the motion passed. Chairman Callow moved to table the July 28, 2014 minutes per some clarification. Hearing no objection, the motion passed.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

A. 2014.1144 2350 SOUTH GRAND COMPTON HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Philip Wagenknecht

Applicant: Richard M. Robinson

DEMOLITION PLAN: Preliminary review of a demolition of a service station and construction of a new commercial building.

PROCEEDINGS: On June 23, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to demolish a service station and construct a single-story commercial building at 2350 South Grand,

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

AUGUST 25, 2014

Page 2 of 7

located in
the Compton Hill Certified Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Erin Wright, Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Board Member David Richardson recused himself from the item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office discussed the project. He stated that the proposal generally complies with the Standards for new construction in the Compton Hill Historic District. He also entered into the record letters of support for the project from the Compton Hill Neighborhood Association and the Compton Hill Reservoir Association. Mr. Bettis also entered into the record a letter opposing the project from Mark Beirn.

Richard Robinson, the owner, testified on his own behalf.

Anne Auer, of the Tower Grove East Neighborhood association testified that the neighborhood generally supports the project but would like to see the scale of the building better match the existing historic buildings along South Grand.

Brian Kolde, a resident of the Tower Grove East neighborhood, testified in support of the project

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 2350 South Grand, is located in the Compton Hill Square Local Historic District;
- the existing building, constructed in the 1960s, is considered non-contributing to the historic district;
- the proposed project generally complies with the neighborhood standards; and that
- the building will be clad in red brick and have other architectural details to complement the historic material of the neighborhood.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project, with the stipulation that final plans and exterior details be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the Compton Heights Historic District Standards.

The motion was made by Alderman Schmid and seconded by Ms. Fathman. The motion passed three to one with Board Member Robinson opposing the motion.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

AUGUST 25, 2014

Page 4 of 7

- the proposed fence is a 6-foot high dark grey vinyl fence. Vinyl is not an approved material for fences under the historic district standards;
- the design of the fencing is similar to the street-facing wood fence on the opposite side of the property;
- the new fence will be visible from the street; and that
- there is no claim of economic hardship as the vinyl fence is more expensive than a wood fence.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the building permit application because the installed fence does not comply with the Kingsbury-Washington Terrace Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board Member Erin Wright and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed with five Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it.

C. 2014.1066 4730-34 McPHERSON AVE. CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Moore Acquisitions LLC

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to re-install two decorative light fixtures on a storefront.

PROCEEDINGS:

On August 25, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to install non-compliant lighting at 4730 McPherson, in the Central West End Local Historic District. The owner submitted the application and the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Craig Schmid, Erin Wright, Melanie Fathman David Richardson, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Central West End Local Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as the proposed lighting is out of scale with building, and the installed bracket mounts have damaged the terra-cotta of the storefront.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

AUGUST 25, 2014

Page 5 of 7

#64689, as amended by #64932 and #69423; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 4730 McPherson; and the building permit application.

Ken Fowler, representing the owner, testified that the owner feels that the light fixtures are appropriate in scale and design and submitted into evidence photographs of other light fixtures in the Central West End.

William Siebert, representing the Central West End Planning and Development Committee, testified in support of the staff recommendation.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4730 McPherson is located in the Central West End Historic District;
- the proposed light fixtures are out of scale with the building's front façade;
- the fixtures are not of appropriate period styling and conceal terracotta detailing; and
- the mounting brackets required for the size and weight of the fixtures have damaged the decorative terra cotta.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the building permit application because the light fixtures do not comply with the Central West End Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion passed with five Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it.

**D. 2014.0928 1845 NORTH MARKET ST. CLEMENS HOUSE-COLUMBIA BREWERY
NATIONAL REGISTER DISTRICT**

Owner/Applicant: Willie & Kellie Swinney

DEMOLITION PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a demolition permit application to demolish a two-story brick residential building.

PROCEEDINGS:

On August 25, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's denial of a demolition application for 1845 North Market, located in the Clemens House-Columbia Brewery

National Register District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Melanie Fathman, Alderman Craig Schmid, Anthony Robinson, Erin Wright and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis, of the Cultural Resources Office, introduced into the record certified copies of Ordinance #64689 as amended by Ordinance #64932 and Ordinance #64832; his presentation and PowerPoint and the Board's agenda. He then made a presentation that examined the requirements of Ordinance 64689, Part X — Demolition Reviews, which states that for buildings within a Preservation Review District, the Preservation Board shall consider specific criteria when assessing whether a demolition should be approved. Mr. Bettis testified that the building was a Merit structure, but is no longer a contributing resource to the Clemens House Columbia Brewery National Register district; he stated that it appeared sound under the definition of the ordinance although there are obvious sign of deferred maintenance. He also stated that historic tax credits were available for its rehabilitation due to the extreme loss of the historic fabric along this stretch of North Market which has lost its context. Ordinance #64689 states that the demolition of Merit or Qualifying Structures shall not be approved except in unusual circumstances.

Kellie and Willie Swinney, owners of the building, were present for the meeting but did not testify.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 1845 North Market is a contributing resource to the Clemens House-Columbia Brewery National Register Historic District; it is a Merit building under the definition of Ordinance #64689.;
- the building stands in a portion of the National Register district that no longer has historic integrity and is not in a Preservation Review District;
- the building appears to be in sound condition although it exhibits the deferred maintenance and repair;
- state and/or federal historic tax credits are available to assist in the funding of a rehabilitation project; however, the potential rehabilitation of this building on a street of new houses of different setback and scale is unlikely;
- a significant loss of historic character through demolition of the North Market block-front took place between 1988 and 2004;

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

AUGUST 25, 2014

Page 7 of 7

- the location of the building on a block-front with historic integrity so weak that it would not meet the requirements for being included in a National Register historic district means that its loss cannot be considered to have the same effect as a building on a block-front in a historic district with a complement of historic buildings and the urban design created by those structures;
- the owner purchased the property in order to demolish the building that stands a few feet from his 2007 residence and has long been vacant. He is not proposing subsequent new construction; and that
- Ordinance #64689 states that the demolition of Merit or Qualifying Structures shall not be approved except in unusual circumstances. The unusual circumstance in this case is that the historic integrity of the block-front is unusually degraded through demolition and new construction, and the block-front can no longer convey its historic character. Therefore the status of the property had in the past as a Merit building is challenged now by notable changes in the character of the properties in historic district.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the application of a demolition permit due to the special circumstances for 1845 North Market. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed five to zero.